

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BEFORE THE CALIFORNIA STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION
651 BANNON STREET
SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA
STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

JUNE 18TH, 2025

CALIFORNIA STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION
BOARD MEETING

---o0o---

ITEM 9

BOARD MEMBER MATTERS:

2025 COUNTY ASSESSOR AND
ASSESSMENT APPEALS BOARD (AAB) ISSUES
BOARD WORK GROUP FOLLOW-UP

---o0o---

REPORTED BY: Jillian M. Sumner, CSR NO. 13619

1 APPEARANCES

2 For the Board of
3 Equalization:

Honorable Ted Gaines
Chairman

4 Honorable Sally J. Lieber
5 Vice Chair

6 Honorable Antonio Vazquez
Third District

7 Honorable Mike Schaefer
8 Fourth District

9 Hasib Emran
10 Appearing for Malia M. Cohen
State Controller
(per Government Code
Section 7.9)

11 For the Board of
12 Equalization Staff:

13 Yvette Stowers
Executive Director

14 Mary Cichetti
15 Clerk
Board Proceedings and
16 Support Services

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1	INDEX	
2		PAGE NO
3	Item 9	1
4	Motion for Attachment 1	2
5	Motion for Attachment 2	26
6	Motion for Attachment 3	23
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION
651 BANNON STREET, SACRAMENTO
JUNE 18TH, 2025

---o0o---

ITEM 9

---o0o---

MR. GAINES: We will now move to Item No. 9;
2025 County Assessor and Assessment Appeals Board Issues
Board Workshop Follow-Up.

And this item is being presented by
Member Vazquez.

MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Chair Gaines.

This item is intended to follow-up on the
April 30th, 2025 Work Group meeting about assessors and
the AAB administrative issues.

As stated in my memo, there are three primary
aims of this item:

- 1) Approving the minutes;
- 2) Scheduling the next Work Group hearing;
- and,
- 3) Discussing and getting a consensus on the
report.

First, let's move, if we could, I would like

1 to request approval of the minutes provided as the
2 attachment to the memo, if you all had a chance to take
3 a look at that.

4 MR. GAINES: Okay. Do we have a motion?

5 That would be to approve the minutes in
6 Attachment 1.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes.

8 MR. GAINES: All right.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Of April 30th.

10 MR. GAINES: Yes. Thank you. April 30th.

11 Okay. Do we have a motion?

12 MR. EMRAN: So moved.

13 MR. GAINES: Okay.

14 And do we have a second?

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: I guess I can second it.

16 MR. GAINES: Be the second? Okay.

17 All right. Very good.

18 And do we have any written comments?

19 I don't think we do.

20 MS. CICHETTI: No written comments.

21 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

22 And I don't see anyone in the audience.

23 AT&T moderator, please let us know if anyone
24 is on the telephone line who would like to make a public
25 comment regarding this item on the agenda.

1 AT&T MODERATOR: If you have a comment, please
2 press one, then zero at this time.
3 There is no one in queue at this time.
4 MR. GAINES: All right.
5 Thank you, moderator.
6 Deputy Controller Emran has made a motion to
7 approve the Work -- excuse me -- yeah -- the Work Group
8 minutes from April 29th, 2025, with Member Vazquez
9 providing the second.
10 Ms. Cichetti, please call the roll.
11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Excuse me.
12 That was April 30th, just for the record.
13 MR. GAINES: Oh. We got a -- yeah. That's
14 right.
15 Correct the record to show April 30th of 2025.
16 So we're approving the minutes for the
17 Work Group on April 30th of 2025.
18 Ms. Cichetti, please call the roll.
19 MS. CICHETTI: Yes. Mm-hm.
20 Chairman Gaines.
21 MR. GAINES: Aye.
22 MS. CICHETTI: Vice Chair Lieber.
23 MS. LIEBER: Aye.
24 MS. CICHETTI: Member Vazquez.
25 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

1 MS. CICHETTI: Member Schaefer.

2 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

3 MS. CICHETTI: Deputy Controller Emran.

4 MR. EMRAN: Aye.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

6 MR. GAINES: Thank you.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Members.

8 You know, that was required under our
9 governance that we take care of that business, first and
10 foremost.

11 With that, let me move on to the second item
12 here. And that's, I would like to request that -- the
13 Board's approval for a second Work Group meeting for
14 September 17th of 2025.

15 As my memo lays out, a September Work Group
16 should be based mainly on midterm and maybe a few
17 long-term recommended solutions, exploring ways to
18 enhance the AAB best practices, guidance and information
19 put out by the Board in collaboration with the AABs.

20 We can get into the particulars about the
21 topics to be addressed at our next Work Group meeting.

22 With that, let me just open it up if there's
23 any questions or comments before I make a motion to move
24 this forward.

25 MR. GAINES: Okay. So I just want to make

1 sure there's clarification in my agenda here.

2 So do we have two items?

3 One was the approval of the minutes, and the
4 second is the call for the September work Group meeting?

5 MS. CICHETTI: Mr. Vazquez, in his report, had
6 asked for three. Mm-hm.

7 MR. GAINES: Okay. I'm sorry. I'm not
8 showing that --

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.

10 MR. GAINES: -- in my script. But we'll
11 incorporate it.

12 MR. VAZQUEZ: Appreciate it.

13 MR. GAINES: Yes.

14 Member Vice Chair Lieber.

15 MS. LIEBER: Thank you.

16 And I know that the piece that I wanted to
17 comment on is No. 2. So I'm okay with -- we've already
18 voted on Item No. 1, and we're about to vote on
19 Item No. 3. But I want to make sure that we go to
20 Item 2, because I had questions about Attachment 2.

21 MR. GAINES: Okay. Why don't we --

22 MS. LIEBER: Do you want to go to that -- that
23 one next?

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: Go ahead.

25 MS. LIEBER: Okay.

1 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

2 MS. LIEBER: So the Item 2 is the
3 "Presentation of the Draft Work Group Report and Initial
4 Recommendations."

5 And under the minutes that we've approved, we
6 would bring back the -- the attachment to
7 recommendations at today's meeting, and then also at
8 subsequent meetings.

9 And I -- I just wanted to make sure that at
10 the last meeting where this was discussed, we wanted to
11 get staff input into the attachment to recommendations.

12 And so I wanted to -- is it your intention
13 that we would approve those today, or that we would wait
14 until September 17th?

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: Wait until September 17th.

16 Only because there was a consensus on some of
17 those issues.

18 MS. LIEBER: Okay.

19 MR. VAZQUEZ: That's why.

20 MS. LIEBER: So I'd just like to make sure
21 that we have the opportunity, and there's ample time
22 between now and September 17th, I think, to get the
23 staff input.

24 Because some of the initial recommendations, I
25 think there's already a statute in place, or some would

1 require a very large budget ask. And we're kind of
2 after the budget process for this year.

3 So I don't know if our Executive Director has
4 comments about that.

5 MS. STOWERS: Thank you.

6 Yvette Stowers, Executive Director.

7 Thank you for the opportunity to speak on this
8 item.

9 On April 30th, Member Vazquez convened the
10 Board Work Group Meeting on the 2025 County Assessors
11 and Assessment Appeal Board issues.

12 During the Board Work Group presentation,
13 presenters provided information on four major topics:

14 Assessment appeals process, key aspects of
15 administrative burdens, property tax refund process, key
16 aspects of administrative burdens, and incorporating
17 technology for small, medium and large service counties,
18 and then, finally, Prop. 19 challenges.

19 Thank you, Member Vazquez, for taking the
20 leadership on this Board Work Group.

21 Thank you to those who made presentations
22 before the Board and provided recommended solutions on
23 how to resolve the issues.

24 Before the Board today is a report on the
25 Board Work Group that summarized the presentations and

1 presenters' recommended solutions.

2 In the report -- or Mr. Vazquez' letter, it
3 indicates there was an agreement on some of those
4 solutions.

5 I have reviewed the report, and it's not clear
6 to me on who is in agreement.

7 Is it that some of the presenters said the
8 same thing?

9 But since it was a Board Work Group, and we
10 were not in a Board Meeting, the Board itself did not
11 take a vote on any of the actions.

12 So it is my understanding today is Mr. Vazquez
13 will be asking the Board to consider and possibly adopt
14 nine of those short-term recommendations, or ask the
15 Board to further review them.

16 We were not asked to partner with Mr. Vazquez'
17 team in reviewing the solutions. But I have taken the
18 time to review them. But my entire team has not
19 reviewed them.

20 Of those nine short-term ones, I do believe
21 that two of them could be implemented in the short term.

22 One being provide additional -- update the AAB
23 member training on Prop. 19 and other specific topics.

24 I believe that this could be done by inviting
25 the AAB members to participate in the technical training

1 that we provide to the assessors' staff.

2 That's that training schedule that Mr. Yeung
3 and his team discuss on a regular basis.

4 And in some of the classes, they can just join
5 in via Teams. And I believe that that would help them
6 in resolving some of the AAB matters.

7 We can also provide them with information on
8 Prop. 19. We have a very informative Prop. 19 page. I
9 know that most of the assessors have a page, or they
10 link to our page.

11 But now that the AAB has their own
12 association, we can make sure that they're tapping into
13 our resources. And we will send them a letter if that's
14 the desire of the Board with all of our resource
15 material.

16 The other item that I think that is possible
17 to implement, if I understand the concern, is Item No. 9
18 on the report, "Find and develop and support legislation
19 that addresses frequently occurring challenges that are
20 creating administrative burdens for assessors."

21 And I believe that's regarding Prop. 19 and
22 the presentation that Sacramento County provided
23 regarding when property goes into trust or probate.

24 And I believe that Sacramento County mentioned
25 that, and a representative from CATA also mentioned it.

1 And one item that I -- if that's what you're
2 talking about, there is a pending legislation, SB 284,
3 that Mr. Angelo will speak on today, that the Board
4 might want to consider supporting.

5 For the other seven items, Ms. Lieber is
6 absolutely correct. Some of them will require changes
7 in budget. Not only on BOE's budget, but it may impact
8 the assessors' budget or the county board of
9 supervisors' budgets.

10 So I would recommend that the Board itself
11 take a look at some of these items, and decide if that's
12 something you would like to pursue.

13 And maybe if you want to pursue, maybe pick
14 your top three, so it's a little bit more manageable.

15 Those are my comments.

16 I'm available for any questions.

17 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

18 Vice Chair Lieber.

19 MS. LIEBER: Thank you.

20 And I appreciate those insights in addition to
21 it.

22 And I'm fine with those things coming back on
23 September 17th.

24 But if there are relatively simple ones that
25 could resolve a public policy need, or could help to

1 bridge a communication that would be important for
2 resolving a current dysfunction, I would be very open to
3 seeing those before September 17th.

4 I don't have a problem with any of the -- I
5 was looking mostly at the short-term recommendations
6 table in Attachment 2.

7 And I don't have a problem with any of those
8 things. But I think that, structurally, there might be
9 a problem with making a budget ask for this year or
10 whatever. But any low-hanging fruit, you know, even if
11 it needs to be brought back to us, and it's before a
12 more extensive hearing, September 17th, then I would
13 welcome hearing it earlier.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Well, what I was hoping to do is
15 move the item in terms of having this hearing, or
16 the -- yeah, I guess you could call it the Work Group
17 second meeting on the 17th, where we can get into the
18 short, middle and long term.

19 And if you give me an opportunity, I'll run
20 through what I had as short term. Some of these things
21 might be able to get resolved before September 17th.

22 These others, there wasn't really consensus.
23 So I think we would have to raise those up in the
24 September 17th meeting with all the stakeholders to see
25 if we can come up with a consensus, especially for the

1 midterm and the long-term items that we have here
2 posted.

3 MS. LIEBER: Yeah.

4 And if I might, just for clarity's sake.

5 Because I don't -- I don't have a problem with
6 anything that's on the short term.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.

8 MS. LIEBER: But -- excuse me.

9 MR. GAINES: Do you need some water?

10 Maybe take a -- yeah. Take a little break
11 there.

12 Now maybe I could just weigh in on the
13 short -- on the short-term actions.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Go ahead.

15 MR. GAINES: I'm assuming that those can be
16 done quickly, and that, therefore, we might have those
17 resolved before the September 17th.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: That was my goal.

19 MR. GAINES: Yes. Okay.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: But, I mean, that -- I would
21 leave that up to staff on those.

22 And I think you -- the Executive Director kind
23 of mentioned some of them.

24 MS. STOWERS: I've identified two of the nine
25 that -- that we can take care of immediately.

1 But the other ones, one, I would need for this
2 Board to provide some direction, if that's -- if that's
3 what you want to do.

4 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.

5 MR. GAINES: Can you identify the --

6 MS. STOWERS: For an example.

7 And I think just what Mr. Vazquez was trying
8 to get to on the exhibit for the short term.

9 The first one is, "Explore options to allow
10 for the sharing of AAB members on a temporary basis
11 between counties."

12 MR. GAINES: Okay.

13 So that is No. 1, short-term action assessment
14 appeal delays, right?

15 And then you go across to recommended
16 solution?

17 MS. STOWERS: Mm-hm.

18 And the recommended solution is to explore
19 options to allow for sharing of AAB members --

20 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

21 MS. STOWERS: -- on a temporary basis between
22 counties.

23 Now, who will explore those options? It's not
24 within our purview.

25 And before whomever explore the options, my

1 question is, did -- this was a comment made by one
2 presenter. So this is one of those where I don't see
3 there was an agreement.

4 So do we know that this is something that the
5 AABs, the county board of supervisors, are looking for?

6 Did the Board Work Group staff do an analysis
7 or consider existing law?

8 We have existing law that provides for
9 multi-jurisdiction assessment appeal boards.

10 Is this existing law not working?

11 What's -- why is there a need to explore
12 options for sharing AAB members on a temporary basis?

13 So it's -- it's -- there's some lack of -- at
14 least from my perspective, lack of understanding of the
15 need of that.

16 And I don't know if this body is asking myself
17 to spend the resources to -- to investigate this, or
18 would this be something that the staff or the Board Work
19 Group would carry out, keeping in line with the charter,
20 or the Board Work Group.

21 The Board Work Group convenes, and it is the
22 Board Work Group that does the heavy lifting with
23 technical advice from the agency.

24 So this is just one example.

25 MR. GAINES: Sure.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: What if we -- you mentioned of
2 the -- on the short term that was listed here, that two
3 would -- wasn't a problem of the nine, I think it's what
4 you said, correct?

5 MS. STOWERS: Yes, two.

6 MR. VAZQUEZ: So why don't we at least get
7 those two out of the way. And then the others that you
8 mentioned that you have some concern about, roll those
9 into our September 17th meeting as possibly midterm or
10 as possibly -- yeah, midterm solutions, as opposed to
11 short-term.

12 Because there -- it sounds like there's some
13 concerns you have on some of these others.

14 MS. STOWERS: Definitely move forward on the
15 ones that I think that we can implement immediately.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.

17 MS. STOWERS: I took the time to number them.

18 So it was No. 3, update the AAB member
19 training on Proposition 19 and other specific topics.

20 My recommended solution is to encourage the
21 AAB members to participate in the BOE technical
22 training, and to provide them information about
23 Proposition 19.

24 If that's the desire of the Board.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: That works for me.

1 MS. STOWERS: I think I'm getting head nods.

2 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yeah.

3 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

4 And then on the sharing of the AAB members on
5 temporary basis between counties, I think we could
6 provide clarity on the law, right, to each of the AB --
7 AABs, and let them -- they're going to have to figure
8 out their own coordination of counties. We're not --
9 that doesn't fall under our purview.

10 MS. STOWERS: So -- but are you suggesting
11 that --

12 MR. GAINES: I think we provide information on
13 how they could go about doing that.

14 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

15 MR. GAINES: But we're not acting as a
16 conduit, are we?

17 MS. STOWERS: Perhaps we can -- if we do go
18 with the September Work Group, we can report out that in
19 lieu of trying to have sharing of AAB members, please
20 note that existing law, starting with RT section 1750,
21 provides for multi-jurisdiction. And that could be a
22 closeout, instead of making a big formal.

23 Because only -- again, only one presenter made
24 that comment.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: That's true.

1 MR. GAINES: Yeah.
2 What do you think, Mr. Vazquez?
3 MR. VAZQUEZ: That works.
4 MR. GAINES: Okay.
5 MS. STOWERS: Okay.
6 MR. GAINES: Yes.
7 And Vice Chair Lieber.
8 MS. LIEBER: Thank you.
9 I think I'm done coughing. Couple minutes
10 here, I will start again soon.
11 But -- so the two that are -- are the
12 low-hanging fruit, would be the first one, exploring the
13 options to allow for sharing of AAB members.
14 And we would -- there is a succinct way of --
15 of communicating that?
16 MS. STOWERS: I will go ahead and call it a
17 low-hanging fruit. And we'll communicate out to our
18 participants at the next meeting.
19 MS. LIEBER: Okay. Great.
20 MS. STOWERS: I don't think -- I don't --
21 unless you guys are asking me to send out a letter. But
22 I think this is the easier way.
23 MS. LIEBER: I like the easier way.
24 But I wonder if it would come back to us at
25 some point to say yes or no to something, or -- or if

1 there are things that can just be achieved very simply.

2 MS. STOWERS: I think for the first one that
3 we're talking about, exploring options, it will come
4 back to the Board. Because at the -- at the next Work
5 Group -- I imagine Member -- Mr. Vazquez, as a chair of
6 that Work Group, would say, "One suggestion was this
7 sharing of resources."

8 "By the way," you know, "you have this ability
9 through this statute."

10 I think that's the easiest way for this one
11 particular item. And I would gladly assist you and your
12 team --

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: That works.

14 MS. STOWERS: -- on the language.

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: If you're comfortable with it.

16 MR. GAINES: Yeah. Yeah.

17 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

18 Now, the ones that I identified, update the
19 AAB member training on prop -- on technical training on
20 Prop. 19, I will prepare a letter inviting them to our
21 technical training.

22 I will send it out to the Board Members as a
23 preview, and provide -- and provide you guys with an
24 opportunity for any feedback.

25 MR. GAINES: And that -- okay.

1 So is that a letter that would go to the AABs?

2 MS. STOWERS: It will -- I think the easiest

3 way to do it is to send it to their new association.

4 MR. GAINES: Okay.

5 MS. STOWERS: And we have contact with them,

6 and they expressed the desire to have the lines of

7 communications open.

8 MR. GAINES: Okay. Could you do that with

9 exploring options to allow sharing of AAB members?

10 MS. STOWERS: Absolutely. That's a good

11 point, because it came from them. So, yes.

12 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

13 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

14 MR. GAINES: Good.

15 And then you can bring it up also at the --

16 the September meeting. Excuse me.

17 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

18 So that's one, and that's three.

19 MR. EMRAN: That's a BOE-hosted training?

20 MS. STOWERS: Yes. It's the technical

21 training that we provide to the auditor -- to the

22 appraiser staff, the assessor staff.

23 MR. EMRAN: Is that in person or virtual?

24 MS. STOWERS: Combination.

25 MR. EMRAN: Got it. Thank you.

1 MR. GAINES: All right.

2 MR. EMRAN: Actually, last question.

3 That's going to be over the summer?

4 MS. STOWERS: The classes are ongoing. We do

5 it on a fiscal year basis.

6 MR. EMRAN: So July 1st is the new fiscal

7 year.

8 MS. STOWERS: And we'll be starting a new

9 session.

10 MR. EMRAN: Got it. Okay.

11 MS. STOWERS: Is it on fiscal? Is it on the

12 calendar?

13 Yeah, it's on the fiscal.

14 MR. EMRAN: Thank you.

15 MR. GAINES: Wonderful. Okay.

16 Vice Chair Lieber.

17 MS. LIEBER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

18 I had a question about the item under

19 informational technology, "Compile a comprehensive list

20 of what counties accept e-filing and other related

21 data."

22 I know that we have a lot of folks coming

23 forward frequently from the advocacy community who would

24 like us to do a lot of research and clerical work for

25 them. And sometimes it's when they already know the

1 answers to it, as well.

2 And so I'm wondering if there's an outside
3 organization that completing that task could be placed
4 with.

5 Because I know that we have given a lot of
6 priorities to our professional staff. And --

7 MS. STOWERS: I don't know about one
8 organization. I appreciate the thought.

9 I do know that's Item No. 6 on the list, and
10 that also came from a single presenter.

11 And we've heard this before from the same
12 organization. And to do such a list from the agent
13 perspective would not be effective, because assessors'
14 technology is changing.

15 So if we were to survey the assessors, they
16 may or may not respond. But let's say we do survey the
17 assessors. And we say, this particular county does not
18 take electronic filing; therefore, they don't have
19 e-signature requirements.

20 But in two weeks it may change. They may have
21 their technology up and running. But we have published
22 something that is incorrect or outdated. And it may be
23 a disservice to whoever's using that list.

24 MR. GAINES: Is that -- could I weigh in?

25 Because I'm just curious as to whether --

1 couldn't we do that maybe on an annual basis? And then
2 we could date -- you know, when you reached out, we
3 could put a date on that particular date. And then you
4 could have a -- maybe a comment in that communication
5 indicating that as of this date, these individual
6 counties had e-filing or not.

7 MS. STOWERS: We could do that if that's the
8 desire of the Board.

9 But I will say this, because I did take some
10 time and check some counties. The counties tell you on
11 their website whether or not they take electronic
12 filing.

13 MR. GAINES: Okay. Okay.

14 Yes. Yeah. Vice Chair Lieber.

15 MS. LIEBER: I'd be okay with letting that
16 particular item slide. And -- and -- because it was
17 coming forward maybe from one advocate.

18 And it is possible for them to have -- have
19 their staff develop that information.

20 And I know that there's a lot of great interns
21 that are part of the Capitol community that would, you
22 know, feel good about going to 58 different Web sites
23 and seeing what the situation is, and creating a
24 spreadsheet and all.

25 So we might want to leave that -- leave that

1 to them. And then kind of be expressing more of our
2 priorities on what we ask staff to do.

3 MR. GAINES: Okay. Any other questions?

4 Do we have a motion?

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: I did move to call for the -- to
6 set aside September 17th for the second day of the
7 September Board Meeting for the assessors' AAB issues
8 Board Work Group.

9 MR. GAINES: Wonderful. Okay. Thank you.

10 And do we have a second?

11 MS. LIEBER: I'll second.

12 MR. GAINES: Okay. Great. Thank you.

13 All right. We don't have any written
14 comments, and I don't see anybody in the audience.

15 AT&T moderator, please let us know if anyone
16 is on the telephone line would like to make a public
17 comment regarding Item 9 on the agenda.

18 AT&T MODERATOR: Thank you.

19 And if you want to make a public comment on
20 Item 9, please press one, then zero at this time.

21 And there's no one in queue.

22 MR. GAINES: Great. Thank you, moderator.

23 Member Vazquez has made a motion to approve
24 the September 17th AAB Work Group meeting, with a second
25 by Vice Chair Lieber.

1 Ms. Cichetti, please call the roll.

2 MS. CICHETTI: Chairman Gaines.

3 MR. GAINES: Aye.

4 MS. CICHETTI: Vice Chair Lieber.

5 MS. LIEBER: Aye.

6 MS. CICHETTI: Member Vazquez.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

8 MS. CICHETTI: Member Schaefer.

9 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

10 MS. CICHETTI: Deputy Controller Emran.

11 MR. EMRAN: Aye.

12 MR. GAINES: Great. The motion passes.

13 Thank you, Members.

14 MR. GAINES: Okay. Now we're going to move on

15 to Item 10.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Well, just before --

17 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: -- you do that. Let me just --

19 MR. GAINES: Sure. Yeah.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: I just wanted to finish up -- at

21 least run through what I was looking at as the midterm

22 and long-term.

23 I mean, we don't have to make a decision. But

24 these are things that'll be coming up --

25 MR. GAINES: Thank you.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: -- on September 17th.

2 MR. GAINES: Yes.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: Just so you can kind of think
4 about this moving forward.

5 And it's -- and it's, basically, I wanted to
6 get into the discussion of the Work Group report
7 attached to the memo.

8 It includes a detailed description of each
9 speaker's testimony, and two attachments that include
10 summaries of the issues identified, and the recommended
11 solutions placed in three categories.

12 And we kind of went into the short term
13 already, but the midterm and the long-term -- and the
14 short-term we kind of addressed already, so let me move
15 into the midterm solutions.

16 Are those that require further discussion and
17 stakeholders input.

18 The medium-term solutions are the agenda items
19 I am proposing to discuss in more detail at the
20 September Work Group meeting.

21 The long-term solutions are those that either
22 require formal processes like legislation, or
23 rulemaking, or collaboration with parties outside of the
24 BOE.

25 In terms of moving forward, my hope is that

1 the Board can reach a general consensus on the report
2 and the tables, so that I can distribute it to the
3 participants and make it publicly available.

4 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: I also hope that the Board can
6 come to a general consensus on the categorization or
7 wording of the solutions.

8 I would like your input on this discussion so
9 we can get it out publicly, if that's possible.

10 MR. GAINES: Absolutely.

11 And would you like a motion for this for
12 accepting the --

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: I appreciate it.

14 MR. GAINES: -- WG report?

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes.

16 MR. GAINES: Okay. Very good.

17 Do you want to make --

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: I'll move that.

19 MR. GAINES: -- that motion?

20 Okay.

21 And do we have a second?

22 MS. LIEBER: Second.

23 MR. GAINES: Okay. Let's see.

24 We've got a motion made by Member Vazquez, and
25 a second by Vice Chair Lieber.

1 Thank you for that.

2 And let's go ahead and see -- there's no
3 written comments. Nobody in the audience.

4 AT&T moderator, please let us know if anyone
5 is on the telephone line and would like to make a public
6 comment regarding Item 9, and that would be the
7 acceptance of the BWG report, Attachment 2.

8 AT&T MODERATOR: Thank you.

9 And if you have a comment on Item 9, please
10 press one, then zero.

11 And we have no one in queue.

12 MR. GAINES: Okay. Thank you, moderator.

13 Members, any questions or discussions on the
14 BWG report, Attachment 2?

15 It's very comprehensive.

16 Did a great job, Member Vazquez.

17 So we will then move forward.

18 And Member Vazquez has made a motion to -- for
19 the Board to accept the BWG report, Attachment 2.

20 And that has been seconded by Vice Chair
21 Lieber.

22 Ms. Cichetti, please call the roll.

23 MS. CICHETTI: Chairman Gaines.

24 MR. GAINES: Aye.

25 MS. CICHETTI: Vice Chair Lieber.

1 MS. LIEBER: Aye.

2 MS. CICHETTI: Member Vazquez.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

4 MS. CICHETTI: Member Schaefer.

5 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

6 MS. CICHETTI: Deputy Controller Emran.

7 MR. EMRAN: Aye.

8 MR. GAINES: All right. The motion passes.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, folks.

10 MR. GAINES: Thank you for clarifying that,

11 Member Vazquez.

12 MR. VAZQUEZ: No. Yeah, I just didn't want

13 you to overlook that.

14 MR. GAINES: Yeah. No, absolutely.

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: I mean, it's all going to come

16 back on the 17th. But I wanted to make sure --

17 MR. GAINES: Yes.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: -- so we could publicly get it

19 out now.

20 MR. GAINES: Yeah. I wasn't clear that there

21 were three --

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yeah. Otherwise, you know,

23 we're bound.

24 MR. GAINES: -- aspects of what you were

25 requesting.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: All right. Thanks.
2 MR. GAINES: So thank you.
3 All right. We're now looking at Item 10.
4 (Whereupon Item 9 concluded.)
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25


1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

State of California)
) ss
County of Sacramento)

I, Jillian Sumner, Hearing Reporter for the
California State Board of Equalization, certify that on
June 18, 2025, I recorded verbatim, in shorthand, to the
best of my ability, the proceedings in the
above-entitled hearing; that I transcribed the shorthand
writing into typewriting; and that the preceding
pages 1 through 29 constitute a complete and accurate
transcription of the shorthand writing.

Dated: July 14th, 2025



JILLIAN SUMNER, CSR #13619
Hearing Reporter