The Board met at its offices at 450 N Street, Sacramento, at 9:30 a.m., with Ms. Harkey, Chairwoman, Mr. Runner, Vice Chair, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Yee present.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Lou Ambrose, Tax Counsel, Appeals Bureau, who was a United States Air Force Intelligence Officer and Cryptologic Linguist.

CORPORATE FRANCHISE AND PERSONAL INCOME TAXES HEARINGS

Gilbert P. Hyatt, 435770
1991, $1,876,471.00 Tax, $1,407,353.25 Fraud Penalty
For Appellant: Gilbert P. Hyatt, Taxpayer
               Bill Leonard, Representative
               Michael W. Kern, Representative
               Edwin P. Antolin, Attorney
For Franchise Tax Board: Bill Hilson, Tax Counsel
                         Scott DePeel, Tax Counsel
                         Ann Hodges, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issues: Whether appellant is taxable as a resident of California on all of his income from September 26, 1991, to December 31, 1991.
        Whether appellant’s income is taxable as California source income.
        Whether respondent Franchise Tax Board has shown that it properly imposed a fraud penalty.
        Whether appellant has shown a legal basis for the abatement of interest under Revenue and Taxation Code section 19104.
Appellant’s Exhibit: Miscellaneous Documents in twenty parts
                    (Exhibit 8.1: part 1, part 2, part 3, part 4, part 5, part 6, part 7, part 8,
                    part 9, part 10, part 11, part 12, part 13, part 14, part 15, part 16, part 17,
                    part 18, part 19, part 20)
Respondent’s Exhibit: October 1991 Calendar of Events (Exhibit 8.2)
Member’s Exhibit: Legal Ruling Number 145 (Exhibit 8.3)

Exhibits to these minutes are incorporated by reference.

The Board recessed at 10:59 a.m. and reconvened at 11:08 a.m. with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Yee present.

Gilbert P. Hyatt, 435770 (Continued)

The Board recessed at 12:52 p.m. and reconvened at 1:45 p.m. with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Yee present.
Gilbert P. Hyatt, 435770 (Continued)
Action: Upon motion of Ms. Harkey, seconded by Mr. Runner and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma and Mr. Horton voting yes, Ms. Yee voting no, the Board reversed the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of fraud.

Upon motion of Mr. Runner, seconded by Ms. Harkey and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner and Mr. Horton voting yes, Ms. Ma and Ms. Yee voting no, the Board determined that the California residency concluded on October 20, 1991.

Ms. Yee moved to sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of California sourced income. The motion was seconded by Ms. Ma. Ms. Yee withdrew her motion.

Mr. Runner moved to reverse the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of California sourced income. The motion was seconded by Ms. Harkey but failed to carry, Ms. Harkey and Mr. Runner voting yes, Ms. Ma and Ms. Yee voting no, Mr. Horton abstaining.

Mr. Runner moved to continue the hearing as to the remaining issues, to the September meeting, and focus the related hearing of Gilbert P. Hyatt, 446509, on the issue of California sourced income. The motion failed for lack of a second.

Upon motion of Ms. Harkey, seconded by Mr. Runner and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Yee voting yes, the Board submitted the appeal for decision as to the issue of California sourced income.

The Board recessed at 6:23 p.m. and reconvened at 6:37 p.m. with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Yee present.

Gilbert P. Hyatt, 435770 (Continued)
Action: Upon motion of Mr. Horton, seconded by Ms. Yee and duly carried, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Yee voting yes, Ms. Harkey and Mr. Runner voting no, the Board sustained the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of California sourced income for 1991.

Ms. Yee left the Boardroom and Ms. Stowers entered on behalf of Ms. Yee in accordance with Government Code section 7.9.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Property Taxpayers’ Bill of Rights Hearings

Mark Sutter, Senior Specialist Property Appraiser, Taxpayer Rights Advocate Office, made introductory remarks regarding the Property Taxpayers’ Bill of Rights hearings. Individuals have the opportunity to present their ideas, concerns, and recommendations regarding legislation, the quality of agency services, and other issues related to the Board’s administration of its tax programs, including state and county property tax programs, and any problems identified in the Taxpayers’ Rights Advocate’s Annual Report (Exhibit 8.4).

Mr. Sutter entered into the record a written submission from Joseph Reinagal (Exhibit 8.5). Mr. Sutter also provided a verbal summary from a taxpayer, who wishes to remain anonymous, regarding the issue of undiscovered new construction.
Speakers: Howard Kato, President, T & M Kato Farms, Inc.
Stephen L. Murphy, Sacramento County Homeowner
Marc A. Aprea, Principal, Aprea & Michel, on behalf of California Alliance of Taxpayer Advocates (CATA) (Exhibit 8.6)
Richard N. Benson, Marin County Assessor/Recorder/Clerk and President of the California Assessors’ Association
John McKibben, Deputy Executive Officer, Los Angeles County Board of Supervisors, California Association of Clerks and Election Officials

Ms. Stowers left the Boardroom and Ms. Yee entered.

CORPORATE FRANCHISE AND PERSONAL INCOME TAXES HEARINGS

Gilbert P. Hyatt, 446509
1992, $5,669,021.00 Tax, $4,251,765.75 Fraud Penalty

For Appellant: Gilbert P. Hyatt, Taxpayer
Bill Leonard, Representative
Michael W. Kern, Representative
Edwin P. Antolin, Attorney

For Franchise Tax Board: Bill Hilson, Tax Counsel
Scott DePeel, Tax Counsel
Ann Hodges, Tax Counsel

Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.

Issues: Whether appellant is taxable as a resident of California on all of his income from January 1, 1992 up to and including April 2, 1992.
Whether a portion of appellant’s income in the year at issue is taxable as California source income.
Whether the FTB has shown that it properly imposed a penalty for fraudulently failing to file a tax return.
Whether appellant has shown a legal basis for the abatement of interest under Revenue and Taxation Code section 19104.

Appellant’s Exhibit: Miscellaneous Documents in twenty parts (See Exhibit 8.1)
Respondent’s Exhibit: January 1992 Calendar of Events (Exhibit 8.7)

Action: Upon motion of Mr. Runner, seconded by Ms. Harkey and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner and Mr. Horton voting yes, Ms. Ma and Ms. Yee voting no, the Board reversed the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of fraud and determined that residency in California concluded October 20, 1991.

Gilbert P. Hyatt, 435770 (Continued)

Action: Upon motion of Ms. Yee, seconded by Mr. Horton and duly carried, Mr. Horton, Ms. Ma and Ms. Yee voting yes, Ms. Harkey and Mr. Runner voting no, the Board sustained the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of interest abatement.
Gilbert P. Hyatt, 446509 (Continued)

Action: Ms. Harkey moved to reverse the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of situs for the year 1992. The motion was seconded by Mr. Runner. Ms. Harkey withdrew her motion.

Ms. Harkey moved to reverse the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of situs in Nevada for the year 1992. The motion was seconded by Mr. Runner. Ms. Harkey offered an amendment to reverse the action of the Franchise Tax Board as to the issue of the California sourced income for 1992. The amended motion was seconded by Mr. Runner and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner and Mr. Horton voting yes, Ms. Ma and Ms. Yee voting no.

ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION

The Board recessed at 10:35 p.m. and reconvened immediately in closed session with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers present.

CLOSED SESSION

The Board met to discuss pending litigation (Gov. Code § 11126(e)), and personnel matters (Gov. Code § 11126(a)).

The Board recessed at 10:54 p.m. and reconvened immediately in open session with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma and Ms. Stowers present.

Joann Richmond, Chief, Board Proceedings Division, announced that closed session will be continued to August 31, 2017.

The Board recessed at 10:55 p.m.

The foregoing minutes are adopted by the Board on October 24, 2017.
The Board met at its offices at 450 N Street, Sacramento, at 9:34 a.m., with Ms. Harkey, Chairwoman, Mr. Runner, Vice Chair, Ms. Ma and Mr. Horton present, Ms. Stowers present on behalf of Ms. Yee in accordance with Government Code section 7.9.

SALES AND USE TAX APPEALS HEARINGS

Braulio C. Godinez Lucachin, 728209 (GH)
04/01/09 to 03/31/12, $17,153.97 Tax
For Petitioner: Braulio Lucachin, Taxpayer
Consuelo Tamara Lucachin, Witness
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Scott Lambert, Hearing Representative
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issue: Whether additional adjustments are warranted to the measure of unreported taxable sales.
Action: Upon motion of Mr. Runner, seconded by Ms. Harkey and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner and Ms. Ma voting yes, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting no, the Board ordered that the petition be granted and the tax be redetermined accordingly.

Hubert Daniel, 546540 (KH)
10/01/05 to 02/17/09, $82,907.80 Tax, $8,290.78 Finality Penalty
For Taxpayer: Hubert Daniel, Taxpayer
Charmaine Morad-Daniel, Witness
Naresh Channaveerappa, Attorney
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Monica Silva, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issues: Whether taxpayer is personally liable as a responsible person for the unpaid liabilities of HCD Properties LLC pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 6829.
Whether adjustments are warranted to the audited understatement of HCD’s reported taxable sales.
Whether taxpayer has established reasonable cause sufficient for relieving the finality penalty originally assessed against HCD.
Whether relief of interest is warranted.

The Board recessed at 12:41 p.m. and reconvened at 1:36 p.m. with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers present.

Hubert Daniel, 546540 (KH) (Continued)
Action: Upon motion of Ms. Harkey, seconded by Mr. Horton and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board ordered that the petition be redetermined as recommended by the Appeals Bureau. The Board directed staff to inform the taxpayer of the Offer in Compromise program.
2017 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Wednesday, August 30, 2017

Greg Moss, 807243 (KH)
04/01/11 to 08/09/11, $27,928.00 Tax, $2,792.80 Late-Payment Penalty
For Petitioner: Greg Moss, Taxpayer
Gerard F. Keena II, Representative
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Andrew Kwee, Tax Counsel

Issues: Whether petitioner is personally liable as a responsible person for the unpaid tax liabilities of Moss Lumber Co., Inc. for the period April 1, 2011, through June 30, 2011, pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 6829.
Whether there is reasonable cause to relieve the late-payment penalty assessed against Moss Lumber and included in petitioner’s responsible person liability.

Action: Upon motion of Ms. Ma, seconded by Ms. Stowers and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board ordered that the petition be redetermined as recommended by the Appeals Bureau. The Board directed staff to inform the taxpayer of the Offer in Compromise program.

Zimmer US, Inc., 773995, 801742 (EA)
04/01/08 to 03/31/11, $2,166,903.00 Claim for Refund
04/01/11 to 09/30/13, $1,494,199.00 Claim for Refund
For Claimant: Susan Bittick, Representative
Brian Browdy, Representative
Erica Love, Representative
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Brad Heller, Tax Counsel

Issue: Whether a refund of use tax reported and paid on the cost of medical instruments shipped to California medical facilities is warranted.

Action: Upon motion of Ms. Harkey, seconded by Mr. Runner and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner and Ms. Ma voting yes, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting no, the Board ordered that the claim for refund be granted. ¹

¹ The Board rescinded this action immediately.

The Board recessed at 4:14 p.m. and reconvened at 4:24 p.m. with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers present.
Dish Network California Service Corporation, 836050, 974472 (OH)
01/01/09 to 12/31/11, $254,595.70 Tax
01/01/09 to 12/31/11, $631,631.39 Claim for Refund
For Petitioner/Claimant: Susan Bittick, Representative
Amanda Angelo, Representative
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Andrew Kwee, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issues: Whether petitioner owes sales tax on its sales of fixtures furnished and installed pursuant to construction contracts and, if so, whether an offset is warranted for sales tax paid by Dish.
Action: Upon motion of Mr. Runner, seconded by Ms. Harkey and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board ordered that the petition and claim be granted, and the tax be redetermined accordingly.

The Board recessed at 5:36 p.m. and reconvened at 5:47 p.m. with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers present.

Key Events, Inc., 600095 (BH)
07/01/01 to 12/31/09, $52,313.03 Tax, $887.18 Amnesty Interest Penalty
Key Events, Inc., 953675 (BH)
04/01/10 to 07/31/14, $40,615.76 Tax
For Petitioner: Heather Keenan, Taxpayer
Priscilla A. Burpee, Witness
Jesse McClellan, Attorney
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Kevin Smith, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issues in the matter of 600095:
Whether additional adjustments to the measure of unreported taxable sales are warranted.
Whether further relief of interest is warranted.
Issue for in the matter of 953675:
Whether adjustments to the measure of disallowed claimed nontaxable sales are warranted.
Action: Upon motion of Mr. Runner, seconded by Ms. Harkey and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma and Mr. Horton voting yes, Ms. Stowers voting no, the Board ordered that the petition be granted, and the tax be redetermined accordingly. The Board directed the Appeals Bureau to prepare a Memorandum Opinion for Board consideration.
Mana, Allison & Associates, Inc., 599640 (BH)
01/01/02 to 12/31/09, $483,344.31 Tax, $4,793.71 Amnesty Interest Penalty
For Petitioner: Glenn Allison, Witness
Dave Mana, Witness
Deshiell Shapiro, Attorney
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Kevin Smith, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issue: Whether adjustments to the measure of disallowed claimed nontaxable sales are warranted.
Action: Ms. Stowers moved to grant the petition based on meeting the 10 percent threshold as a safe harbor. Ms. Stowers withdrew her motion.
Upon motion of Mr. Runner, seconded by Ms. Harkey and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma and Mr. Horton voting yes, Ms. Stowers voting no, the Board ordered that the petition be granted and the tax be redetermined accordingly.

Incentive Destination Productions, Inc., 742443 (AR)
01/01/03 to 12/31/09, $69,579.22 Tax, $0.00 Failure to File Penalty
For Petitioner: James Dumler, Representative
Jesse McClellan, Attorney
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Kevin Smith, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issues: Whether adjustments to the measure of disallowed claimed nontaxable sales are warranted.
Whether additional interest should be relieved.
Jeff Angeja, Tax Counsel, Appeals Bureau, Legal Division, advised of the revised recommendation of the Appeals Bureau based on Key Events precedential decision, the liability is redetermined in accordance with the precedential decision which will now eliminate the liability.
Action: Upon motion of Mr. Runner, seconded by Ms. Harkey and duly carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma and Mr. Horton voting yes, Ms. Stowers voting no, the Board ordered that the petition be redetermined in accordance with the revised recommendation of the Appeals Bureau.

FINAL ACTION ON SALES AND USE TAX APPEALS HEARING HELD AUGUST 30, 2017

Public Motors Orange County, LLC, 766507 (EA)
01/01/10 to 12/31/12, $19,670.24 Tax
For Petitioner: Waived Appearance
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Nenita DeLa Cruz, Hearing Representative
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issue: Whether adjustments are warranted to the amount of unreported taxable sales.
Wednesday, August 30, 2017

Action: Upon motion of Mr. Horton, seconded by Mr. Runner and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board ordered that the petition be redetermined as recommended by the Appeals Bureau.

The Board recessed at 6:45 p.m.

The foregoing minutes are adopted by the Board on October 24, 2017.

Note: The following matter was removed from the calendar prior to the meeting: Medimarts, Inc., 763614.
The Board met at its offices at 450 N Street, Sacramento, at 9:35 a.m., with Ms. Harkey, Chairwoman, Mr. Runner, Vice Chair, Ms. Ma and Mr. Horton present, Ms. Stowers present on behalf of Ms. Yee in accordance with Government Code section 7.9.

Ms. Harkey discussed the remaining 2017 workload and the December 2017 Sacramento meeting dates. Ms. Harkey directed staff to work with Members’ offices to consider adding a third meeting day in December.

**SALES AND USE TAX APPEALS HEARINGS**

Robin Groth-Hill, 814350 (CH)
10/01/08 to 08/24/11, $1,913,195.34 Tax, $725,775.60 Failure to Remit Collected Tax Penalty, $191,085.36 Finality Penalty, $465.04 Late-Payment Penalty, $7,885.20 Negligence Penalty, $1,755.55 Failure-to-File Penalty
For Petitioner: Robin Groth, Taxpayer
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Scott Claremon, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issues: Whether petitioner is personally liable as a responsible person for the unpaid liabilities of Groth Bros. Oldsmobile, Inc. (Groth), pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 6829.
Whether adjustments are warranted to the tax assessed in the determinations issued to Groth.
Whether the 40-percent penalty for failure to report collected sales tax reimbursement is supported by clear and convincing evidence.
Whether relief of the penalties assessed against Groth and included in petitioner’s liability under section 6829 is warranted.
Whether Groth was negligent during the liability period 1Q11 through May 17, 2011.
Action: The Board continued the hearing to the October 2017 Sacramento meeting.

Jagtar Singh Kandola, 809478 (KH)
10/01/09 to 09/30/10, $37,985.58 Tax, $7,110.91 Late-Payment Penalty
For Petitioner: Jagtar S. Kandola, Taxpayer
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Scott Claremon, Tax Counsel
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Issues: Whether petitioner is personally liable as a responsible person for the unpaid liabilities of K & W Slocum, Inc., pursuant to Revenue and Taxation Code section 6829.
Whether relief of the penalties assessed against Slocum and included in petitioner’s liability under section 6829 is warranted.
Action: Mr. Runner moved to lower the amount of equal liability for the liquor license and remove the late payment penalty. The motion was seconded by Ms. Harkey. Ms. Harkey made a substitute motion that the petition be granted and the tax be redetermined accordingly. The substitute motion was seconded by Mr. Runner and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes.
SPECIAL TAXES APPEALS HEARING

James R. Kidder, 668928, 690129, 690130 (STF)
07/01/11 to 06/30/12, $1,918.00 Fee, $00.00 Failure-to-File Penalty
07/01/09 to 09/30/09, $118.56 Fee
07/01/10 to 09/30/10, $90.72 Fee

For Petitioner: Gary Kimzey, Representative
For Business Tax and Fee Department: Joseph Boniwell, Tax Counsel

Issue: Whether petitioner is liable for the underground storage tank maintenance fees.
Action: Upon motion of Ms. Harkey, seconded by Mr. Runner and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board ordered that the disputed collection fees be waived and that the petition otherwise be redetermined as recommended by the Appeals Bureau.

LEGAL APPEALS MATTERS, CONSENT

With respect to the Legal Appeals Matters Consent Agenda, upon a single motion of Mr. Horton, seconded by Mr. Runner and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board made the following orders:

Agoura Auto Spa, Inc., 851962 (AR)
07/01/10 to 03/31/14, $13,728.26 Tax, $0.00 Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Edward Joseph Dumaine, III, 717962 (EH)
07/01/08 to 10/08/09, $52,343.59 Tax, $19,552.30 Failure to File Penalty, $574.30 Late Payment Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Shelton Lang Gayles, 733871 (EA)
03/01/08 to 12/31/09, $22,445.00 Tax, $820.00 Failure to File Penalty, $1,804.40 Late Payment Penalty, $820.00 Finality Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Michael Henderson, 841751 (FH)
01/01/10 to 12/31/12, $40,678.89 Tax, $10,169.76 Fraud Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Jonathan Francis Knecht, 588615 (AC)
01/01/98 to 03/31/00, $00.00 Tax, $47,779.08 Fraud Penalty, $18,747.40 Finality Penalty, $925.00 Collection Cost Recovery Fee
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.
Kaisuen Kong, 516021 (EA)
07/01/05 to 09/30/06, $188,003.38 Tax, $18,799.41 Finality Penalty, $925.00 Collection Cost Recovery Fee
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Nu Ground, Inc., 841096 (EA)
04/01/10 to 02/04/14, $113,812.47 Tax
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

PJ Elite, LLC, 594364 (AR)
01/01/08 to 03/31/11, $6,007,738.00 Tax, $3,735.00 Negligence Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Patricia S. Serna, 790470 (FH)
07/01/09 to 06/30/12, $5,967.83 Tax, $0.00 Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Kurt William Walker, 733406 (RC)
01/01/06 to 01/14/10, $1,524.04 Tax, $3,632.10 Late Payment Penalty, $1,723.60 Finality Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

Elmer Munoz, 849940 (AA)
07/01/10 to 12/31/13, $32,787.18 Tax, $0.00 Penalty
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

East Bay Supply, Inc., 745876 (CH)
10/01/05 to 09/30/08, $103,673.08 Tax
Action: Redetermine as recommended by the Appeals Division.

CORPORATE FRANCHISE AND PERSONAL INCOME TAX MATTERS, CONSENT

With respect to the Corporate Franchise and Personal Income Tax Matters Consent Agenda, upon a single motion of Mr. Horton, seconded by Mr. Runner and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board made the following orders:

Kashif Ahmed and Ana J. Ahmed, 937348
2009, $9,200.00 Tax, $1,840.00 Accuracy-related Penalty
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Biofyz, LLC, 972763
2015, $851.68 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.
Susanna L. Chenette, 949716
2012, $4,951.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Vinay Devaki, 926547
2012, $2,147.25 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Easy Care Medical Clinic, PLLC, 933497
Claim for Refund
2010, $425.00 Demand Penalty, $82.00 Filing Enforcement Fee, $170.00 Collection Cost Fee, $42.00 Lien Fee
2011, $200.00 Demand Penalty, $78.00 Filing Enforcement Fee
2012, $200.00 Late Payment Penalty
Action: Modify the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Estate of Sheldon D. Schott (Dec'd) and Pamela E. Schott, 931596
2009, $7,261.55 Interest
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Thomas C. Ford, 927547
2013, $21,754.66 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Winston Francis and Christine Francis, 959389
2014, $584.38 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Genicicity, Inc., 957433
2013, $437.96 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Eric K. Gonzalez, 942377
2010, $549.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Ernest Graham and Janice Smith, 668153
2001, $141,774.00 Tax, $211,611.53 Penalties
2003, $112,623.00 Tax, $22,524.60 Accuracy-related Penalty
2005, $1,280,646.00 Tax, $532,919.25 Penalties
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board as modified by its concessions.

Edgar J. Green and Ruth Green, 870132
2010, $1,584.00 Assessment
2011, $996.00 Assessment
2012, $2,055.00 Assessment
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.
2017 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Thursday, August 31, 2017

Robert Hicks and Monica Hicks, 856691
2010, $14,352.00 Tax, $2,870.40 Accuracy-related Penalty
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Chandra E. Hunt, 946689
2011, $3,608.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board as modified by its concessions on appeal.

Andre Jackson, 937588
2013, $9,568.00 Tax, $2,392.00 Late Filing Penalty, $2,392.00 Demand Penalty
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board and impose a $5,000.00 frivolous appeal penalty.

Sheen Xavier James, 951158
2009, $1,772.88 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Reuben V. Legaspi, 954483
2009, $1,947.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Conrad J. Lopes and Ramona Burdeos, 935750
2014, $16,424.00 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board as modified by its concessions on appeal.

Jorge M. Lopez, 957175
2012, $1,058.96 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Matoza Investments, Inc., 925476
2013, $433.78 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Juan Morales, 950895
2014, $127.00 Tax, $127.00 Late Filing Fee
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Orbis Invest, LLC, 939664
2013, $437.96 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Maria A. Pacheco, 941520
2013, $1,755.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.
Anil L. Pandya and Sheetal A. Pandya, 871577
2010, $32,328.00 Assessment
2011, $29,745.00 Assessment
2012, $42,073.00 Assessment
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Kevin Perteete, 939671
2005, $1,613.12 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Primrose Wallace, LLC, 953146
2010, $200.00 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Maria S. Raigoza, 923762
2010, $1,817.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Sabar, LLC, 976564
2014, $396.00 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Norman E. Schrock and Claudia M. Schrock, 956829
2010, $4,237.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Bo Shen and Xin Shen, 930531
2010, $6,670.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

William C. Smail, 856271
2012, $12,911.00 Tax, $3,227.75 Late Filing Penalty
2013, $19,423.00 Tax, 4,855.75 Late Filing Penalty, $5,247.50 Demand Penalty, $76.00 Filing
Enforcement Fee
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Deepa Sreenivasan, 943530
2014 $1,327.68 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

The Sierra Trust No. 2, 941655
2014, $8,420.00 Claim for Refund
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.
United Southwest Construction, Inc., 974829
2014, $200.00 Claim for Refund, $12.10 Estimated Tax Penalty
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Thomas G. Van Dyke and Margaret S. Van Dyke, 864562
2000, $18,809.00 Tax, $4,702.25 Late Filing Penalty, $3,171.40 Post-Amnesty Penalty
2001, $13,633.00 Tax, $3,408.25 Late Filing Penalty, $3,408.25 Post-Amnesty Penalty
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Rosario Velasco, 937788
2013, $1,183.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board.

Frederick Scott Walmsley, 941222
2013, $1,123.00 Tax, $280.75 Late Filing Penalty, $280.75 Demand Penalty, $76.00 Filing Enforcement Fee
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board as modified by its concessions on appeal.

Qingli Zhang, 954411
2012, $465.00 Tax
Action: Sustain the action of the Franchise Tax Board as modified by its concessions on appeal.

LEGAL APPEALS MATTER, ADJUDICATORY

Stars Holding Co., LLC, 855845 (CH)
04/01/13 to 12/31/13, $35,238.66 Claim for Refund
Considered by the Board: March 29, 2017
Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.
Action: Upon motion of Ms. Harkey, seconded by Mr. Runner and unanimously carried, Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board ordered that the petition for rehearing be denied as recommended by the Appeals Bureau.

ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION

OTHER ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

Executive Director’s Report

David Gau, Executive Director, provided a report regarding the status of pending and upcoming organizational issues.
The Board recessed at 12:42 p.m. and reconvened immediately in closed session with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers present.

CLOSED SESSION

The Board met to discuss pending litigation (Gov. Code § 11126(e)), and personnel matters (Gov. Code § 11126(a)).

The Board recessed at 1:10 p.m. and reconvened immediately in open session with Ms. Harkey, Mr. Runner, Ms. Ma, Mr. Horton and Ms. Stowers present.

The Board adjourned at 1:12 p.m.

The foregoing minutes are adopted by the Board on October 24, 2017.

Note: The following matter was removed from the calendar prior to the meeting: Max Rogers, 639424.